

2007 Total Compensation Supplemental Out-of-State Survey

Department of Personnel Administration Labor Relations Division Office of Financial Management and Economic Research 1515 S Street, North Building, Suite 400 Sacramento, California 95814



| Table of Contents P | age |
|--|-----|
| Executive Summary | . 1 |
| Summary of Survey Responses by Other States | 1 |
| Table 1: Organizations Responding to Survey | 2 |
| Table 2: State of California Salary Comparison to Other States | 2 |
| Table 3: State of California Motor Carrie Specialist Salary Comparison to US DepartmentTransportation Motor Carrier Safety Specialist-Investigator | 3 |
| Table 4: Cost of Living Comparison between California and Surveyed States | 4 |

Appendices

Appendix 1 – Out-of-State Data by Class

Appendix 2 – Table of Survey Responses

Appendix 3 – Copy of Survey Instrument



Executive Summary

The 2007 Total Compensation Survey includes a survey of three benchmark classifications with salary and benefits data from other states that the Department of Personnel Administration (DPA) administered internally. These three classifications are a supplement to the 2007 Total Compensation Survey conducted by CPS. The specifications indicated that the State is responsible for carrying out the duties of the three classifications. Consequently, there are no comparables at the local level. The survey results are the following:

- ♦ Compliance Representatives monthly total compensation lead is 11.7 percent or \$704 when compared to eleven other states.
- ♦ Licensing-Registration Examiners monthly total compensation lead is 5.3 percent (\$258).
- ◆ The highest California lead is for the Motor Carrier Specialist. The monthly total compensation lead is 16.4 percent (\$975). However, Federal Motor Carrier Safety Specialists working in California earn more and the State lags by 6.6 percent in total compensation. The MOU mandates that California compares salaries for this classification with the Federal government class.
- ♦ The State lags the Federal government locality pay in the Bay Area by 16.4% and Southern California locality pay by 10.4%. Since both areas are recognized as a very high cost-of-living areas, the lags are not surprising.

Summary of Survey Responses by Other States

A Total Compensation Survey seeks data with regard to all the key components of compensation in order to quantify the total value of those components, and facilitate comparisons of the complete compensation packages offered by various employers. For this Total Compensation Survey, those compensation components are:

The State lags the Federal government locality pay in the Bay Area by 16.4% and Southern California locality pay by 10.4%. Since both areas are recognized as a very high cost-of-living area, the lags are not surprising.

The three classifications that the DPA surveyed separately, and are a supplement to the 2007 Total Compensation Survey conducted by CPS, are the following:

- ◆ Compliance Representative The journey-level Compliance Representative performs a full range of tax and revenue related tasks needed to fulfill tax revenue and collection services used by the state.
- ◆ Licensing-Registration Examiner The journey-level Examiner perform the most difficult and sensitive work in driver licensing, vehicle registration, and related areas dealing directly with the public in a Department of Motor Vehicles' assigned field office.
- Motor Carrier Specialist The journey-level Inspector is responsible for ensuring that motor carriers are in compliance with State and Federal laws and regulations pertaining to operating, safety, mechanical, preventive maintenance, and hazardous materials handling practices to ensure the safety of the motoring public.



In total, 15 states received the 2007 Total Compensation Survey and of those, eleven states responded. The federal government data was collected from the Office of Personnel Management website for a total of twelve response organizations.

The following, Table 1 show the states that responded to the survey and the number of matches made for each of the classifications by each state.

Table 1 – Organizations Responding to Survey

| Other States | Class Matches |
|------------------------|---------------|
| State of Arizona | 3 |
| State of Indiana | 3 |
| State of Massachusetts | 2 |
| State of Montana | 3 |
| State of Nevada | 3 |
| State of New Hampshire | 3 |
| State of New Jersey | 3 |
| State of New York | 3 |
| State of Ohio | 3 |
| State of Oregon | 2 |
| State of Utah | 3 |
| Federal Government | 2 |

The comparison of California to other states shows that the state leads the other states:

- ◆ The highest California lead is for the Motor Carrier Specialist, \$785 in monthly maximum base salary (17.0%). With benefits added for total compensation, the lead increases to \$975 (16.4%).
- ♦ For compliance representatives the maximum monthly salary lead is \$380 (8.1%) and the total compensation lead is \$704 (11.7%).
- ♦ Licensing-Registration Examiners monthly maximum base salary is \$151 higher (4.2%) and increases to \$258 (5.3%) with total compensation.

Table 2 – State of California Salary Comparison to Other States

| Classification | State of CA Maximum Base Salary | Survey Median Max Base Salary | State Relationship to Median | State of CA Maximum Total Compensation | | State Relationship to Median |
|---------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|---------|------------------------------------|
| Compliance Representative | \$4,670 | \$4,290 | 8.1% | \$6,005 | \$5,301 | 11.7% |
| Licensing-Registration Examiner | \$3,588 | \$3,437 | 4.2% | \$4,840 | \$4,583 | 5.3% |
| Motor Carrier Specialist | \$4,622 | \$3,837 | 17.0% | \$5,954 | \$4,978 | 16.4% |



The current Protective Services and Public Safety Bargaining Contract mandates the comparison of the Motor Carrier Specialist classification and its compensation to the US Department of Transportation Motor Carrier Specialist Investigator. Table 3 provides the comparison.

Table 3 – State of California Motor Carrier Specialist Salary Comparison to US Department of Transportation Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator

| STATE OF ASSESSED OF THE STATE | Motor Carrier Specialist | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|-----------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------|--------|-----------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|---|
| Surveyed Agency | Classification Title | Monthly Min. | Monthly Max. | Longevity Pay | Deferred Comp | Retirement Pickup | Cafeteria Plan | Health | Dental | Vision | Social Security | Monthly Total Compensation | State Relationship to Geographic Area Salary |
| State of California | Motor Carrier Specialist | \$3,835 | \$4,622 | | | | | \$978 | | Inc. in medical | \$354 | \$5,954 | \$5,954 |
| Federal Government - Rest of California | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator | \$3,644 | \$4,737 | | \$237 | | | \$697 | | | \$362 | \$6,034 | -1.35% |
| Federal Government - Sacramento Area | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator | \$3,850 | \$5,005 | | \$250 | | | \$697 | | | \$383 | \$6,335 | -6.40% |
| Federal Government - Bay Area | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator | \$4,217 | \$5,482 | | \$274 | | | \$697 | | | \$419 | \$6,872 | -15.42% |
| Federal Government - Los Angeles Area | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator | \$4,013 | \$5,217 | | \$261 | | | \$697 | | | \$399 | \$6,573 | -10.41% |
| Federal Government - San Diego Area | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist Investigator | \$3,893 | \$5,016 | | \$251 | | | \$697 | | | \$384 | \$6,348 | -6.62% |
| | Base Salary Median | | \$5,016 | | | | | | | Base Sa | lary Median | \$6,348 | ' |
| | Base Salary Mean | | \$5,091 | | | | | | | Base S | Salary Mean | \$6,432 | |
| | State Relationship to Median | | -8.53% | | | | | | State Relationship to Media | | | -6.62% | |
| | State Relationship to Mean | | -10.15% | | | | | | State | Relations | hip to Mean | -8.04% | |

Note: The Federal salary comparison is for four locality pay areas: Sacramento Region, Bay Area, Los Angeles Region, and San Diego Region, and the Rest of the State.

The State lags the Federal government locality pay in the Bay Area by 16.4% and Southern California locality pay by 10.4%. Since both areas are recognized as a very high cost-of-living area, the lags are not surprising.

The comparison shows that the State lags the federal government by 8.5 percent in median monthly maximum salary and 6.6 percent in total compensation.



Cost of Living Comparison

The annual maximum salary level paid by the State of California for each of the three benchmark classifications is the salary comparison. The salaries for each are the following:

- Compliance Rep-\$56,040
- Licensing/Registration Examiner-\$43,056 and
- Motor Carrier Specialist-\$55,464.

The data show that the largest cost element that affects the cost of living in California is the cost of housing and makes the largest contribution to the lower cost of living in other states.

Table 4 – Cost of Living Comparison between California and Surveyed States

| Surveyed State | Compliance Representative | Licensing/ Registration Examiner | Motor Carrier Specialist |
|----------------|------------------------------|--|-----------------------------|
| California | 100.0% | 100.0% | 100.0% |
| Arizona | -58.3% | -67.0% | -58.6% |
| Indiana | -76.5% | -86.0% | -76.8% |
| Massachusetts | -34.6% | -37.5% | -34.7% |
| Montana | -70.4% | -78.8% | -70.7% |
| Nevada | -41.8% | -47.4% | -42.0% |
| New Hampshire | -50.0% | -54.6% | -50.1% |
| New Jersey | -32.4% | -37.9% | -32.6% |
| New York | -14.2% | -17.0% | -14.3% |
| Ohio | -73.5% | -82.9% | -73.9% |
| Oregon | -49.3% | -57.6% | -49.6% |
| Utah | -73.7% | -81.8% | -74.0% |

Source: ERI Relocation Assessor, and statewide data averages are as of April 2008.

The cost of living comparison calculation uses ERI Relocation Assessor data¹ and compares average statewide living costs that include the following: consumables, transportation, health services, housing/utilities/property taxes, income/payroll taxes, and miscellaneous cost elements to calculate the cost of living estimate.

As the data above indicates, the cost of living is lower in the surveyed states. Indiana consistently has the lowest level when compared to California. New York cost of living is only 14.2% lower for those earning a salary comparable to the California Compliance Representative.

¹ ERI Relocation Assessor data is the property of the Economic Research Institute.



4

Supplemental Appendix 1 Out-of-State Data by Class





Compliance Representative

| ADMIN'S | Compilation Reproduita | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------|--|--------------|--------------|------------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Surveyed Agency | Classification Title | Monthly Min. | Monthly Max. | Longevity Pay | Deferred Comp | Retirement Pickup | Cafeteria Plan | Health | Dental | Vision | Social Security | Monthly Total Compensation |
| State of California | Compliance Representative | \$3,841 | \$4,670 | | | | | \$978 | Inc. in medical | Inc. in medical | \$357 | \$6,005 |
| State of Arizona | Tax Analyst II | \$3,603 | \$5,294 | | | | | \$1,125 | \$44 | | \$405 | \$6,867 |
| State of Indiana | Tax Analyst 4 | \$1,992 | \$3,264 | | | | | \$963 | \$62 | \$4 | | \$4,293 |
| State of Massachusetts | Tax Examiner II | \$3,423 | \$4,892 | | | | | \$1,467 | \$60 | Inc. with dental | \$71 | \$6,490 |
| State of Montana | Tax Examiner - Band 5 | \$2,364 | \$3,546 | | | | | \$557 | Inc. in medical | | \$271 | \$4,374 |
| State of Nevada | Tax Examiner II | \$2,683 | \$4,343 | \$88 | | | | \$808 | Inc. in medical | Inc. | \$63 | \$5,301 |
| State of New Hampshire | Tax Auditor I | \$2,364 | \$3,135 | | | | | \$1,536 | \$13 | Inc. in medical | \$240 | \$4,923 |
| State of New Jersy | Taxpayer Service Representative 3 | \$3,275 | \$4,618 | | | | | \$897 | \$59 | | \$353 | \$5,927 |
| State of New York | Tax Compliance Representative I (SG Code 11) | \$2,678 | \$3,283 | | | | | \$862 | | | \$251 | \$4,395 |
| State of Ohio | Tax Commisioner Agent 2 | \$3,075 | \$3,934 | | | | | \$754 | \$71 | | \$57 | \$4,816 |
| State of Oregon | No Comparable Match | | | | | | | | | | | |
| State of Utah | Compliance Agent II | \$2,853 | \$4,946 | | | | | \$1,044 | \$81 | \$0 | \$378 | \$6,449 |
| Federal Government | Tax Specialist | \$3,300 | \$4,290 | | \$214 | | | \$697 | | | \$328 | \$5,529 |

| Base Salary Median | \$4,290 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$4,140 |
| State Relationship to Median | 8.15% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 11.34% |

Number of Comparable Matches 11

Data Effective: September 1, 2007

| Base Salary Median | \$5,301 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$5,397 |
| State Relationship to Median | 11.72% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 10.13% |



Licensing-Registration Examiner

| TORES ADMINISTR | Licensing-Registration Ex | amme | | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------|--|--------------|--------------|------------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Surveyed Agency | Classification Title | Monthly Min. | Monthly Max. | Longevity Pay | Deferred Comp | Retirement Pickup | Cafeteria Plan | Health | Dental | Vision | Social Security | Monthly Total Compensation |
| State of California | Licensing-Registration Examiner | \$3,015 | \$3,588 | | | | | \$978 | Inc. in medical | Inc. in medical | \$274 | \$4,840 |
| State of Arizona | Motor Vehicle Customer Service Representative | \$2,444 | \$3,327 | | | | | \$1,125 | \$44 | | \$255 | \$4,750 |
| State of Indiana | Driver Examiner | \$1,837 | \$2,172 | | | | | \$963 | \$62 | \$4 | \$166 | \$3,368 |
| State of Massachusetts | Driver's License Examiner | \$2,741 | \$3,929 | | | | | \$1,467 | \$60 | Inc. with dental | \$57 | \$5,512 |
| State of Montana | License Permit Technician | \$2,028 | \$3,042 | | | | | \$557 | Inc. in medical | | \$233 | \$3,832 |
| State of Nevada | Motor Vehicle Licensing-Registration Examiner | \$2,579 | \$4,155 | \$88 | | | | \$808 | Inc. in medical | | \$60 | \$5,111 |
| State of New Hampshire | Licensing Officer | \$2,331 | \$3,082 | | | | | \$1,536 | \$13 | Inc. in medical | \$236 | \$4,866 |
| State of New Jersy | Examination Technician Motor Vehicles | \$2,628 | \$3,681 | | | | | \$897 | \$59 | | \$282 | \$4,918 |
| State of New York | Motor Vehicle License Examiner (SG Code 12) | \$2,831 | \$3,457 | | | | | \$862 | | | \$264 | \$4,583 |
| State of Ohio | Driver's License Examiner 2 | \$2,739 | \$3,604 | | | | | \$754 | \$71 | | \$52 | \$4,481 |
| State of Oregon | Transporation Service Representative 2 | \$2,388 | \$3,437 | | | | | \$1,007 | \$93 | Inc. in medical | | \$4,536 |
| State of Utah | Tax/Motor Vehicle Tech II | \$2,007 | \$3,034 | | | | | \$1,044 | \$81 | \$0 | \$232 | \$4,391 |
| Federal Government | No Comparable Match | | | | | | | | | | | |

| Base Salary Median | \$3,437 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$3,356 |
| State Relationship to Median | 4.21% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 6.46% |
| | |

Number of Comparable Matches 11

| Base Salary Median | \$4,583 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$4,577 |
| State Relationship to Median | 5.32% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 5.44% |
| | |

Data Effective: September 1, 2007



Motor Carrier Specialist

| ADMIN'S | wotor carrier specialist | | | | | | | | | | | |
|------------------------|--|--------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|
| Surveyed Agency | Classification Title | Monthly Min. | Monthly Max. | Longevity Pay | Deferred Comp | Retirement Pickup | Cafeteria Plan | Health | Dental | Vision | Social Security | Monthly Total Compensation |
| State of California | Motor Carrier Specialist | \$3,835 | \$4,622 | | | | | \$978 | Inc. in medical | Inc. in medical | \$354 | \$5,954 |
| State of Arizona | Motor Vehicle Field Office II | \$2,629 | \$3,539 | | | | | \$1,125 | \$44 | | \$271 | \$4,978 |
| State of Indiana | Motor Carrier Inspector | \$2,265 | \$3,160 | | | | | \$963 | \$62 | \$4 | \$242 | \$4,431 |
| State of Massachusetts | No Comparable Match | | | | | | | | | | | |
| State of Montana | Motor Vehicle Safety Inspector | \$2,384 | \$3,576 | | | | | \$557 | Inc. in medical | | \$274 | \$4,407 |
| State of Nevada | Commercial Vehicle Inspector | \$3,047 | \$4,964 | \$88 | | | | \$808 | Inc. in medical | Inc. | \$72 | \$5,931 |
| State of New Hampshire | Highway Patrol and Enforcement Officer | \$3,389 | \$4,517 | | | | | \$1,536 | \$13 | Inc. in medical | \$346 | \$6,411 |
| State of New Jersy | Safety Specialist 1, DMV | \$3,275 | \$4,618 | | | | | \$897 | \$59 | | \$353 | \$5,927 |
| State of New York | Motor Vehicle Inspector | \$3,019 | \$3,837 | | | | | \$862 | | | \$294 | \$4,992 |
| State of Ohio | Motor Carrier Enforcement Inspector | \$2,971 | \$3,934 | | | | | \$754 | \$71 | | \$57 | \$4,816 |
| State of Oregon | Motor Carrier Enforcement Officer | \$2,388 | \$3,437 | | | | | \$1,007 | \$93 | Inc. in medical | | \$4,536 |
| State of Utah | Motor Carrier Specialist II | \$2,444 | \$3,476 | | | | | \$1,044 | \$81 | \$0 | \$266 | \$4,866 |
| Federal Government | Motor Carrier Safety Specialist | \$3,644 | \$4,737 | | \$237 | | | \$697 | | | \$362 | \$6,034 |

| Base Salary Median | \$3,837 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$3,981 |
| State Relationship to Median | 16.99% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 13.86% |
| | |

Number of Comparable Matches 11

| Base Salary Median | \$4,978 |
|------------------------------|---------|
| Base Salary Mean | \$5,212 |
| State Relationship to Median | 16.38% |
| State Relationship to Mean | 12.46% |

Data Effective: September 1, 2007

Supplemental Appendix 2 Out-of-State Data by Class



| TABLE 1 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY COLA HISTORY | | | | | | | |
|---|--|---------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Agency | General Employees | Professional Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees | | | | |
| DPA | Last 7-1-07 @ 3.4% Next TBD | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Arizona | 7-1-07 @ 3% Next TBD | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Indiana | DNA | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Massachusetts | DNA | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Montana | 10-01-06 @ 4% or \$1,188 whichever is larger Next 10-10-07 @ 3% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Nevada | 1-1-07 @ 2% Next 7-1-08 @ 4% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of New Hampshire | 7-07 @ \$0.51 per hour 1-08 @ 3.5% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of New Jersey | 7-7-07 @ 3% Next 7-08 @ 3% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of New York | NA ¹ | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Ohio | 7-1-07 @ 3.5% Next 7-1-08 @ 3.5% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Oregon | 7-1-07 @ 3% Next 11-1-08 @ 3.2% | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| State of Utah | 7-1-07 @ 3.5% Next TBD | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| Federal Government | DNA | N/A | N/A | | | | |

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available

NOTE: New York State does not provide a COLA, but a location pay. NYC, Westchester, Rockland, and Nassau/Suffolk counties receive \$1,302. Orange, Putman, and Dutchess counties receive \$651



TABLE 2 DPA **2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY WORK WEEK** Supervisory / **Professional General Employees** Management **Agency Employees Employees** DPA 40 hours N/A N/A State of Arizona 40 hours N/A N/A State of Indiana 37.5 hours N/A N/A State of Massachusetts 37.5 hours N/A N/A N/A N/A State of Montana 40 hours N/A N/A State of Nevada 40 hours State of New Hampshire N/A N/A 37.5 or 40 hours At least 35 hours N/A N/A State of New Jersey 37.5 hours N/A N/A State of New York 40 hours N/A N/A State of Ohio 40 hours N/A N/A State of Oregon N/A 40 hours N/A State of Utah

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available

Federal Government



N/A

N/A

DNA

TABLE 3 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY EMPLOYER & EMPLOYEE CONTRIBUTION TO MEDICAL

| Agency | General E | Employees | Professiona | l Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees | | |
|---------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------|--|
| Agency | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | |
| DPA | \$879 or CoBen \$978 | \$165 or CoBen \$196 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Arizona | \$1,125 | \$125 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Indiana | \$963 | \$290 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Massachusetts | \$1,147 | \$367 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Montana | \$557 | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Nevada | \$808 | \$122 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Hampshire | \$1,536 | \$54 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Jersey | \$897 | 1.5% of monthly salary | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New York | \$862 | \$194 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Ohio | \$754 | \$133 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Oregon | \$1,007 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Utah | \$1,044 | \$79 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| Federal Government | \$697 | \$395 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |

N/A = Data not applicable

DNA = Data not available



TABLE 4 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY EMPLOYER & EMPLOYEE CONTRIBUTION TO DENTAL

| General Employees Agency | | mployees | Professiona | l Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------|--|
| Agency | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | |
| DPA | \$90 CoBen Inc. in Med. | \$30 CoBen inc. in Medical | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Arizona | \$44 | \$54 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Indiana | \$62 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Massachusetts | \$60 | \$15 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Montana | Incl. in medical | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Nevada | Incl. in medical | Incl. in medical | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Hampshire | \$123 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Jersey | \$27 | \$27 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New York | DNA | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Ohio | \$71 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Oregon | \$93 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Utah | \$81 | \$4 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| Federal Government | \$0 | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |

N/A = Data not applicable

DNA = Data not available



TABLE 5 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY EMPLOYER & EMPLOYEE CONTRIBUTION TO VISION

| General Employees Agency | | mployees | Professiona | l Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees | | |
|---------------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------|--|
| Agency | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | Employer Cost | Employee Cost | |
| DPA | \$9 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Arizona | \$0 | \$17 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Indiana | \$4 | \$6 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Massachusetts | Incl. with dental | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Montana | DNA | \$22 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Nevada | Incl. in medical | Incl. in medical | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Hampshire | Incl. in medical | Incl. in medical | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New Jersey | DNA | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of New York | DNA | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Ohio | \$18 | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Oregon | Incl. in medical | \$0 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| State of Utah | \$0 | \$16 | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |
| Federal Government | \$0 | DNA | N/A | N/A | N/A | N/A | |

N/A = Data not applicable

DNA = Data not available



TABLE 6 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RETIREMENT PRACTICES

| AGENCY | Type of Retirement | PERS/Ind. Employee Portion | PERS/Ind. Employee Portion Paid by Employer | Retirement Benefit | Retirement Formula | Social Security Practices | Employer Retirement Contribution |
|---------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|---|---|---|---------------------------------|---|
| DPA | PERS | 5% | 0% | 2% @ 55 | Avg. Highest 3 Years | 7.65% | 16.6% |
| State of Arizona | Arizona State Retirement System | 9.1% | 0% | 2.1% @ 0-19.99 yrs. to high of 2.3% @ 30 yrs. | Highest 36 consecutive months in last 10 years | 7.65% | 20% |
| State of Indiana | PERF | N/A | 3% to annuity fund | 1.1% | Highest 5 consecutive years | 7.65% | N/A |
| State of Massachusetts | Mass. State Retirement Plan | 9% or 11% if salary > \$30,000 | 0% | Age X yrs. of service X salary | Highest 3 years | 1.45% | 0% |
| State of Montana | PERS | 6.9% | 6.9% | 2% X highest 3 years | Highest 3 years | 7.65% | 6.9% |
| State of Nevada | ER and EE Plan or ER only Plan | 10.5% under ER/EE Plan | 0% | 2.5% prior to 7-1- 2001 and 2.67% after 7-1-2001 X yrs. of service | Highest 3 years | .5 FTE pay 7.65% FT 1.45% | 10.5% for ER/EE Plan or 20.5% for ER only plan |
| State of New Hampshire | NH Retirement System | 5.0% | 0% | Avg. final comp X Service credit | Highest 3 years | 7.65% | 8.74% |
| State of New Jersey | PERS | 5.5% | 0% | Yrs. of Service/55 X Final Avg. Comp | Last 36 months | DNA | 0% |
| State of New York | Employees Retirement System | 3% | 0% | 1.66% w/20 yrs | Highest 3 years | 7.65% | 10.84% |
| State of Ohio | OPERS | 9.5% | 0% | 2.2% X final salary X yrs of service | Avg. of highest 3 years | 1.45% | 13.77% |
| State of Oregon | PERS | DNA | 100% | 1.67% X yrs. of service | Avg. highest 3 years | 7.65% | DNA |
| State of Utah | Utah Retirement System | 0% | N/A | 2% X Yrs of service | Highest 3 yrs. | 7.65% | 14.21% |
| Federal Government | FERS | DNA | DNA | 1% of highest 3 years x 3 of years | Average of 3 years | 7.65% | 11.5% |

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available



TABLE 7 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RETIREE HEALTH COVERAGE PRACTICES MONTHLY AMOUNT PAID BY EMPLOYER

| Agency | General Employees | Professional Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees |
|---------------------------|---|------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| DPA | Retiree Only \$439 Medical \$35 Dental Retiree/Spouse \$823 Medical \$62 Dental Retiree/Family \$1,042 Medical \$90 Dental | N/A | N/A |
| State of Arizona | No contribution to retiree health | N/A | N/A |
| State of Indiana | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| State of Massachusetts | Retiree Only \$124 Medical, \$24 Dental Retiree/Spouse \$288 Medical, \$58 Dental Retiree/Family \$288 Medical, \$58 Dental | N/A | N/A |
| State of Montana | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| State of Nevada | Retiree Only \$360 Medical, Dental included Retiree/Spouse \$639, Dental included Retiree/Family \$530, Dental included | N/A | N/A |
| State of New Hampshire | Retiree Only < 65 \$834, 65+ \$413 Medical only Retiree/Spouse \$1,667 Medical only Retiree/Family \$2,251 Medical only | N/A | N/A |
| State of New Jersey | DNA | N/A | N/A |
| State of New York | Retiree Only \$412 Medical only Retiree/Spouse NA Retiree/Family \$862 only | N/A | N/A |

TABLE 7 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY RETIREE HEALTH COVERAGE PRACTICES MONTHLY AMOUNT PAID BY EMPLOYER

| Agency | General Employees | Professional Employees | Supervisory / Management Employees |
|--------------------|---|------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| State of Ohio | Based on years of service | N/A | N/A |
| State of Oregon | Retiree Only \$60 Medical | N/A | N/A |
| State of Utah | Retiree Only \$388 Medical only Retiree/Spouse \$800 Medical only Retiree/Family \$1,068 Medical only | N/A | N/A |
| Federal Government | Retiree Only \$697 | N/A | N/A |

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available



TABLE 8 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY LEAVE PRACTICES GENERAL EMPLOYEES

| | Vacation Leave | | | | | | | Sick Leave | | | | | | |
|---------------------------|----------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|----------------------------|--|
| Agency | Yea | ar 1 | Yea | ar 5 | Yea | r 10 | Ye | ar15 | Yea | ar 20 | Olok | LCave | Holidays | |
| | Annual | Max | Annual | Max | Annual | Max | Annual | Max | Annual | Max | Annual | Max | | |
| DPA | 10.5 | 10.5 | 15 | 15 | 18 | 18 | 19.5 | 19.5 | 21 | 21 | 12 | No Max | 14 | |
| State of Arizona | 12 | 30 | 15 | 30 | 18 | 30 | 21 | 30 | 21 | 30 | 12 | No max | 10 | |
| State of Indiana | 12 | No max | 15 | No max | 20 | No max | 20 | No max | 25 | No max | 9 | No max | 12 | |
| State of Massachusetts | 12 | DNA | 15 | DNA | 20 | DNA | 20 | DNA | 25 | DNA | 15 | DNA | 11 13 in Suffolk Co. | |
| State of Montana | 15 | 15 | 15 | 30 | 18 | 36 | 21 | 42 | 24 | 48 | 12 | No max | 10.5 | |
| State of Nevada | 15 | 30 | 15 | 30 | 18 | 30 | 21 | 30 | 21 | 30 | 15 | No max | 11 | |
| State of New Hampshire | 12 | 12 | 15 | 32 | 18 | 38 | 18 | 38 | 21 | 44 | 15 | 120 | 10 | |
| State of New Jersey | 12 | 12 | 12 | 24 | 15 | 30 | 20 | 40 | 25 | 50 | 15 | DNA | 13 | |
| State of New York | 13 | 40 | 18 | 40 | 20 | 40 | 21 | 40 | 22 | 40 | 13 | 200 | 12 | |
| State of Ohio | 10 | 30 | 15 | 45 | 20 | 60 | 22.5 | 67.5 | 25 | 75 | 10 | No max | 10 | |
| State of Oregon | 12 | DNA | 15 | DNA | 18 | DNA | 21 | DNA | 24 | 325 | 12 | No max | 10+3 Personal | |
| State of Utah | 13 | 320 | 16.25 | 320 | 19.5 | 320 | N/A | N/A | 22.75 | 320 | 13 | No max | 11 | |
| Federal Government | 13 | 240 | 13 | 240 | 17 | 240 | 17 | 240 | 20 | 240 | 13 | No max | 10 | |

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available



TABLE 9 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY LONGEVITY, DEFERRED COMP, & INCENTIVE PAY

| Agency | Longevity | Deferred Compensation | Incentive & Bonus Pay |
|------------------------|---|--------------------------|-----------------------------|
| DPA | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| State of Arizona | None | N/A | 2.75% group performance pay |
| State of Indiana | None | \$15 per pay period | \$284 annual spot bonus |
| State of Massachusetts | Bargaining issue | N/A | None for general employees |
| State of Montana | 1.5% @5 yrs; 2.0% @10 yrs; 2.0% @ 15 yrs; 2.0% @20 yrs; 1.5% @ 25 yrs; 1.5% @ 30 yrs. uninterrupted state service | N/A | N/A |
| State of Nevada | 8 yrs\$75 semi-annual 10 yrs\$125 semi-annual 15 yrs\$275 semi-annual 20 yrs\$525 semi-annual 25 yrs\$800 semi-annual 30 yrs.+ \$1,175 semi-annual | N/A | N/A |
| State of New Hampshire | \$300 after 10yrs; and \$300 for each additional 5 yrs. | N/A | N/A |
| State of New Jersey | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| State of New York | 5 yrs. \$750 annually 10 yrs. additional \$750 annually | N/A | N/A |
| State of Ohio | 0.5% * # of years of service * 1 st step of pay range-starts at 5 years of service, max out at 20 years | N/A | N/A |
| State of Oregon | N/A | N/A | N/A |
| State of Utah | 8+ yrs. service & at max salary receive 2.75% salary increase each year | 1.5% | N/A |
| Federal Government | N/A | 5% | N/A |

N/A = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available



TABLE 10 DPA 2007 TOTAL COMPENSATION SURVEY **RECRUITMENT & RETENTION CONCERNS Agency Recruitment & Retention DPA No Comments** State of Arizona No Comments State of Indiana Motor Carrier class has retention problem because of low pay. Compliance Representative recruitment problem, want to hire a candidate State of Massachusetts with any degree. No Comments State of Montana Compliance Representative retention problems. State of Nevada Motor Carrier Sp. Are difficult to recruit & retain, salary problem. State of New Hampshire No Comments Taxpayer Service Representatives are not difficult to recruit, but are difficult State of New Jersey to retain because they work in call-in and walk-in centers and stress is high. No Comments State of New York No Comments State of Ohio

No Comments

No Comments

No Comments

NA = Data not applicable DNA = Data not available

State of Oregon

State of Utah

Federal Government



Supplemental Appendix 3 Copy of Survey Instrument



INTRODUCTION AND GENERAL INSTRUCTIONS

The State of California, Department of Personnel Administration is conducting a Total Compensation Survey for three benchmark classes. We would greatly appreciate your assistance in collecting the requested information.

This Total Compensation Survey instrument is comprised of five sections:

- The first section asks some general information questions with respect to your agency.
- The second section represents the Total Compensation Survey and provides structured salary data collection sheets on page 4. The descriptions for these survey classes are provided on page 5. If your agency has a comparable class, please provide the requested information.
 - Note that the monthly minimum and maximum salary provided to your agency's comparable class is requested.
 - Please list the bargaining group that represents each of your agency's classes that you are able to match to the survey classes.
 - Please list the number of budgeted positions and filled positions for each comparable classification
- The third and fourth sections of this survey (pages 6-9), provides structured benefits data and retirement information collection sheets. This information is particularly critical to our efforts to survey for Total Compensation.
- The fifth section of this survey (page 10), requests information on recruitment and retention issues.

In completing the survey, we ask that you do the following:

- 1. Please complete all sections of the questionnaire using the **September 1, 2007** salary and benefit information for your agency's classification that matches the benchmark classification.
- 2. Please include copies of your agency's salary schedules, organization charts and the classification specifications for the comparable classes, or provide the website address where this information may be found.
- 3. Please email the completed survey by **September 21, 2007**, to LiisaRohmer@dpa.ca.gov
- 4. If you have any questions about the survey or any of the data being requested, please contact Liisa Rohmer by e-mail or at (916) 324-3865.

Thank you for your cooperation and participation.

PARTICIPATING AGENCY CONTACT INFORMATION

| necessary. | | |
|------------------|------------|----------------|
| | | |
| Agency Name | | |
| | | |
| Address | | |
| | | |
| Contact Name | Title | |
| | | |
| Telephone Number | Fax Number | E-mail Address |

Please complete the following information so that we can track responses and follow-up as

| I. GENERAL IN | NFORMATION | | |
|---|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|
| Please provide information concerning cost-of-living-adjustment (COLA) increases for the following: | | | |
| | General Employees | Last COLA Date | Amount |
| | | Next COLA Date | Amount |
| Please provide th | ne number of hours per week (40, | etc.) considered to be full time | e employment with your agency for the following: |
| | General Employees | - | |

II. COMPENSATION SURVEY

Salary Data Collection Sheets - Refer to Descriptions on Page 5.

| # | Survey Class Title | Your Agency's Class Title | Min. monthly salary (as of 9/07) | Max. monthly salary (as of 9/07) | Bargaining Unit of matched class | Number of budgeted positions | Number of filled positions |
|---|---|---------------------------|--|----------------------------------|----------------------------------|------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| 1 | Compliance Representative | | | | | | |
| 2 | Motor Vehicle Licensing- Registration Examiner | | | | | | |
| 3 | Commercial Vehicle Inspector | | | | | | |

| # | SURVEY CLASS | CLASS DESCRIPTION |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Compliance Representative | This is a journey level class that performs a full range of tax and revenue related tasks needed to fulfill tax revenue and collection services used by the state. Positions provide assistance to business entities, or taxpayers to ensure compliance with tax laws, collect delinquent taxes or other debts, and perform a variety of compliance and collection functions. They ensure compliance with personal, corporation and employer tax laws, and other revenue programs. Positions may serve in technical, staff and administrative roles to fulfill various aspects of compliance and collection work, including collection, registration, revocation, and, in some cases, preliminary criminal investigation. Education: One year of experience performing tax compliance or debt collections work. OR graduation from college, which must include at least one course each in basic accounting or Federal or State taxation and business or commercial law; and one course in either economics, business administration, or public administration. |
| 2 | Motor Vehicle Licensing- Registration Examiner | Under general direction, the journey-level Examiner perform the most difficult and sensitive work in driver licensing, vehicle registration, and related areas dealing directly with the public in a Department of Motor Vehicles' assigned field office. At least 50% of any duties involve giving practical performance tests to applicants. Two years of experience in the Department of Motor Vehicles is required. |
| 3 | Commercial Vehicle Inspector | Under general supervision, the journey-level inspector is responsible for ensuring that motor carriers are in compliance with State and Federal laws and regulations pertaining to operating, safety, mechanical, preventive maintenance, and hazardous materials handling practices to ensure the safety of the motoring public. The inspector prepares comprehensive written reports of inspections conducted; makes detailed investigations of vehicles involved in accidents to determine if the cause was mechanical, and when called upon, serves as a technical expert on a multidisciplinary accident investigation team to investigate complex or multiple fatality motor vehicle accidents. Four years of experience in journey level mechanics including mechanical repair and preventive maintenance program or automotive or mechanical engineering experience. |

III. BENEFITS SURVEY

- This is a survey of your employee benefits and costs as of September 1, 2007.
- If employees do not receive a specific benefit, please enter "NA" for "not applicable" in the appropriate columns.
- Please report all premiums as a monthly cost.

| Retirement Contribution Practices | General Employees |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| What is the total Employer contribution, as a percentage of base salary? | |
| What is the total <i>Employee</i> contribution, regardless of who pays it, as a percentage of base salary? | |
| What is the percentage of the <i>Employee</i> contribution paid by <i>Employer</i> (if applicable)? | |
| What is the percentage of the <i>Employee</i> contribution paid by the <i>Employee</i> (if applicable)? | |
| Deferred Compensation Practices | General Employees |
| What is the maximum <i>Employer</i> contribution (enter as dollars or percentage of base salary)? | |
| | |
| Longevity Pay Practices | General Employees |
| Longevity Pay Practices Enter the amount paid per month, in dollars, or as a percentage of salary, for premium pay based on length of service. Enter each level of longevity pay including the year of service and corresponding pay amount. | General Employees |
| Enter the amount paid per month, in dollars, or as a percentage of salary, for premium pay based on length of service. Enter each level of longevity pay including | General Employees General Employees |
| Enter the amount paid per month, in dollars, or as a percentage of salary, for premium pay based on length of service. Enter each level of longevity pay including the year of service and corresponding pay amount. | |
| Enter the amount paid per month, in dollars, or as a percentage of salary, for premium pay based on length of service. Enter each level of longevity pay including the year of service and corresponding pay amount. Incentive/Bonus Pay If you have an incentive or bonus pay program, provide the average amount paid across the organization at the last payout and the date of last payout. Please attach | |

| Cafeteria Plan Practices - If your agency has a cafeteria plan provision, please answer the following questions. | General Employees |
|--|-------------------|
| Enter <i>maximum</i> monthly amount paid by employer | |
| Enter <i>maximum</i> monthly amount paid by employee | |

For health-related benefits, provided separate from a cafeteria plan, please base your responses on the **most commonly selected plan** (combined employer and employee contribution) for family coverage.

| Medical Insurance Costs | General Employees |
|---|-------------------|
| List the <u>employer's</u> <i>maximum</i> contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). | |
| List the <u>employee's</u> <i>maximum</i> contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). | |
| Dental Insurance Costs | General Employees |
| List the employer's maximum contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). If cost is included in medical, indicate by entering "inc." | |
| List the <u>employee's</u> <i>maximum</i> contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). | |
| Vision Insurance Costs | General Employees |
| List the <u>employer's</u> maximum contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). If the cost is included in medical, indicate by entering "inc." | |
| List the <u>employee's</u> maximum contribution for full family coverage (for the most commonly selected plan). | |

| Vacation Leave | General E | imployees |
|--|-------------------|-------------|
| Enter the number of days accrued per year for each year of service, as well as the maximum amount that can be accrued in that year. | Annual Accrual | Max Accrual |
| Year 1 | | |
| Year 5 | | |
| Year 10 | | |
| Year 15 | | |
| Year 20 | | |
| Maximum Accrual Rate | | |
| List the year of service for maximum accrual | | |
| Sick Leave | General E | mployees |
| List the number of days per year and the maximum accrual. | Annual Accrual | Max Accrual |
| acciuai. | | |
| Holidays | General E | imployees |
| List the number of holidays provided each year to each group. | | |

| IV. RETIREMENT INFORMATION | |
|--|-------------------|
| Retirement Benefit Information | General Employees |
| What is the retirement formula provided to employees (e.g. <u>2% @ 55</u> , etc.)? | |
| What is the compensation component of your agency's retirement formula (e.g. highest year, etc)? | |
| Please list the retirement plan your agency provides to employees (e.g. 37 Act, CalPERS, etc.). | |
| What is your agency's vesting policy for eligibility for retirement (e.g. employee must have at least 5 years of service to be eligible)? | |
| What is the monthly amount paid by the <i>employer</i> for retiree medical coverage for the following categories? Please use the most common medical plan as the basis for the premium (e.g. Kaiser, Blue Shield HMO, etc.) and identify what the most common plan is. | |
| Retiree Only | |
| Retiree and Spouse | |
| Retiree and Family | |
| Most Commonly Used Plan | |
| What is the monthly amount paid by the <i>employer</i> for retiree dental coverage for the following categories? Please use the most expensive dental plan as the basis for the premium and identify what the most common plan is. Retiree Only | |
| Retiree and Spouse | |
| Retiree and Family | |
| Most Commonly Used Plan | |
| Does your agency have a vesting policy for eligibility for retiree medical and/or dental (e.g. employee must have at least 5 years of service to be eligible)? | |
| If yes, what is the eligibility requirement? | |

V. RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION INFORMATION

For the classifications included in this survey, does your state have employee recruitment and retention problems? If so, please check the affected classifications in the following list.

| Compliance Representative Motor Vehicle Licensing-Registration Examiner Motor Carrier Specialist | Yes No Yes No Yes No |
|--|---|
| Please explain what steps you are taking to help al | leviate any recruitment and retention problems. |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |